

Rakhine Shelter Cluster Coordination Meeting

Minutes

Venue: Office of the State Minister of Transport and Communication

Date: Friday 11th October 2013

Time: 9:45 am to 11:15 am

Minutes: Zaw Min Htet, UNHCR

Participants: DRD, UNHCR, DRC, MRF, MRCS, MAUK, CARE, SI, LWF, OCHA & UNICEF (see participants list)

Updates:

Agency	Update
Rakhine State Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Data unavailable b) DRD Executive Engineer (EE) to follow up and feedback to Shelter Cluster to update the 3W Shelter matrix. c) EE stated that the current shelter commitments satisfy the needs for temporary shelter in Rakhine State.
Myanmar Red Cross Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> d) Contracts signed with contractors (30th Sept) for 50 temporary 8-unit shelters in Rathedaung, Minbya, Mrauk U and Kyawtaw. These shelters will cover gaps identified by the township authorities. e) Construction to commence on payment of 1st instalment (30%) from HQ.
Myanmar Resource Foundation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> f) 115 temporary 8-unit shelters in OTG (N) and 9 in OTG (S) completed in rural Sittwe. g) In the process of identify land in Maw Thi Ngar for an additional 9 temporary shelters (Total: 124). h) Shelter Cluster Coordinator requested close coordination between MRF, UNHCR, DRD and SCI to ensure appropriate site planning and the inclusion of additional infrastructure on the camp maps being prepared by UNHCR. These maps will be printed onto vinyl signboards to be erected at the entrances of camps by DRD.
Muslim Aid UK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Waiting for HQ approval before constructing 22 additional 8 unit shelters in Kyein Ni Pyin, Pauktaw in answer to a request made by the camp committee.
Danish Refugee Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> j) All temporary shelters in Ah Nauk Ywe and Sin thet Maw are complete. k) Reported the destruction of walkways by IDPs (see discussion below).
International Committee of the Red Cross	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> l) 10 of the 19 proposed 8 unit shelters to replace 1st generation Government constructed shelters in Baw Du Par 2 are complete and 9 are awaiting the delivery of high quality CGI roofing sheets. m) Completion of these shelters replaces <u>all</u> thatch roofed shelters with CGI
UNHCR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communal kitchens constructed by UNHCR, DRC & MAUK have not been successful in Sittwe with IDPs preferring to cook their meals inside their shelters. Participatory design exercises have been conducted with women in Baw Du Par. UNHCR will conduct a small pilot project for the 7 communal kitchens constructed by MAUK in Baw Du Par to retrofit them into communal domestic spaces. As the kitchen floors are already covered with hard-core, a 5" concrete slab will be laid, the internal partitions removed. Each group of 5 shelters will be provided the freedom to convert the kitchens into alternative communal areas. • UNHCR Shelter Team has been working in collaboration with the Protection Working Group to improve privacy, particularly for women, in temporary shelters. UNHCR will launch a pilot

	<p>project using the 32 shelters (256 HH units) constructed by MAUK in Baw Du Par investigating and responding to shelter/protection mainstreaming. In addition, the specific needs of the elderly will be considered through collaboration with HelpAge.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Handover documents for 662 temporary 8 unit shelters constructed in Sittwe (300), Pauktaw (267) and Myebon (95) were submitted to the Rakhine State Government. The handover document has already been approved by the State Government and will serve as a standard for the shelter cluster as agreed by Shelter Cluster partners. UNHCR will disseminate both English and Myanmar versions for cluster partners.
--	--

1. Inter-agency assessment in Thandwe:

- The Shelter Cluster Coordinator reported that he represented cluster partners in the 11 member inter-agency assessment team which visited Thandwe between 4th and the 6th October. The team met with officials and received a thorough briefing of the situation before visiting 4 villages where the majority of the 110 houses had been burnt.

Situation

- The Cluster Coordinator praised the swift and effective response by both MRCS and the Government.
- On the 5th October, approximately 450 IDPs from both Rakhine and Kaman communities are displaced to host communities. Due to restrictions of movement and subsequently trade, these host communities are also in need of assistance in the form of food aid.
- Rakhine State Government has stated that IDPs are free to return to the plots where houses were burnt. The general feeling from the Kaman communities was a desire to return to point of origin once appropriate levels of security were assured. Rakhine IDPs tended to favour relocation into communities exclusively Rakhine.

Action Point:

- OCHA to disseminate both the English and Myanmar versions of the report from the Inter-Agency Assessment in Thandwe (4-6th October 2013), to all Shelter Cluster partners through the Shelter Cluster mailing list.

Shelter

- Relief and Resettlement Department (RRD) were in the process of distributing a tent for each of the affected households to cover their immediate emergency shelter needs.
- Union Government made public assurances that the Rakhine State Government will provide permanent shelter to the affected households from both communities at point of origin.
- MRCS stated that the national society did not have plans to be involved in the construction of permanent shelter. However, a meeting to be held on 14-15 October in Yangon would gauge the interest of donors.

The role of the Shelter Cluster in Thandwe

- UNHCR suggested that the construction of permanent shelter in Thandwe by the Government for all the affected households of both communities provide the Shelter Cluster the opportunity to establish minimum standards for the construction of permanent housing in Rakhine State. The suggestion was met with unanimous agreement by members including the State Director for the Department of Rural Development (DRD).

Action Point:

- Department for Rural Development (DRD) to lead a Technical Working Group comprised of shelter cluster partners to establish guidelines for minimum standards for the construction of permanent shelter in Rakhine State.

Non-Food Items

- NFI needs are being covered by MRCS. MRCS in Sittwe confirmed that 112 family kits of 7 items including kitchen sets were distributed; one to each of the affected families.
- MRCS will be monitoring the NFI needs of the affected population

2. Cyclone or Tropical Storm Preparedness

- The Cluster Coordinator invited partners to an open discussion regarding the possibility of a cyclone or tropical storm hitting Rakhine State over the next few weeks.
- The Executive Engineer of DRD reported that a meeting was being held to discuss government preparedness for a possible cyclone. The State Director was representing the Department for Rural Development and the results of the meeting would be shared with agencies.
- Action Contre La Faim (ACF) has hired a disaster preparedness and disaster risk reduction specialist to further the work done in preparation for Cyclone Maharsen during the previous cyclone season. The consultant has been working in Sittwe for a week.

Action Point:

- OCHA to coordinate with the Rakhine State Government through the Point of Contact (PoC) to update the 'Contingency Plan for Cyclones and Tropical Storms' and disseminate to all Shelter Cluster partners.
- OCHA to coordinate with ACF who have already initiated work on updating the Contingency Plan.

3. Vacant Shelters in Rural Sittwe

- Cluster partners reported a total of 150 vacant shelters in rural Sittwe (1,200 HH units or approximately 7,200 IDPs) in Ohn Taw Gyi North; 45 shelters constructed by CARE Myanmar, 45 by MRF and 60 by the Government.
- Some vacant shelters are being destroyed by IDPs and used for firewood in both Sittwe and Pauktaw.
- The Cluster Coordinator raised the point that despite assurances from the government to be more transparent regarding the relocation of IDPs, cluster partners have not been privy to any information regarding the relocation of IDPs until the last minute at best. The issue of the construction of an excess number of temporary shelters was previously raised by UNHCR at Cluster meetings in August regarding the construction of an additional 424 shelters by CARE (224) and the Government (200). At this time the Government stated that the sub-committee for relocation would share relocation plans. However, these plans have never materialized. Without knowing the Government's relocation plans, it is not possible for the Shelter Cluster to conduct a gap analysis for temporary shelter and achieve shelter objective 1, '*to achieve 100% coverage for temporary shelter*', from the Rakhine Response Plan (July-Dec 2013).

Action Point:

- OCHA to coordinate with the Rakhine State Government through the Point of Contact (PoC) to disseminate the Government's Relocation Plan for IDPs to all Shelter Cluster partners.

4. Condition of Shelters

Repair and Maintenance

- Vacant shelters in Sittwe and Pauktaw are being targeted for destruction for firewood and materials for improving shelters.
- Deterioration of shelters in IDP camps is becoming more apparent. In Baw Du Par and Say Tha Mar Gyi, roofs on the early generation shelters are badly damaged and require repair. DRC are currently improving conditions in Say Tha Mar Gyi camp.
- UNHCR reported the implementation of a pilot project with 150 shelters providing each cluster of 5 shelters with a maintenance and repair toolkit. The toolkits which will be kept in locked metal tool boxes in Camp Management Offices and will be managed by the camp committee. The toolkit has been approved by the State Director of DRD who in turn is informing the Security Minister before distribution. The toolkit includes a range of nails but not additional bamboo as it is believed that the provision of bamboo which is both available and affordable would send the wrong message to IDPs regarding the maintenance of temporary shelters.

The pilot project will be evaluated after one month through post distribution monitoring in order to scale up and provide maintenance and repair kits to all temporary shelters across Rakhine State by the end of 2013 (600 maintenance and repair toolkits).

- The CCCM Cluster Coordinator pointed out that some CCCM partners have already budgeted for maintenance and repair kits in their CCCM projects. Explained that the UNHCR pilot project and subsequent post distribution monitoring and evaluation could help to determine a Shelter Cluster standard for the contents of maintenance and repair kits in the Rakhine context to be scaled-up by Shelter Cluster and CCCM partners. The contents of the proposed maintenance and repair kits with photos will be disseminated across Shelter and CCCM Cluster partners for comment. However, UNHCR stresses that this is only a pilot and that adjustments to the tools and nails etc... will be adjusted based on the feedback from the post distribution monitoring and evaluation.
- The CCCM Cluster Coordinator suggested that a monitoring system for the deterioration of temporary shelters could be implemented through CCCM partners and camp managers. The UNHCR Shelter Team will take the lead in developing the first draft of the monitoring form. Shelter Cluster partners will be provided the opportunity to review the monitoring form for comments and suggestions.

Statements

- Responsibility for repairing and maintaining temporary shelters lies with the Rakhine State Government as outlined in the handover agreement.
- Shelter Cluster partners accept responsibility to support the Rakhine State Government for maintenance and repair of issues affecting the structural integrity of temporary shelters as well as the provision of maintenance toolkits.
- CCCM Cluster accepts responsibility to support the Rakhine State Government for minor maintenance and repairs of temporary shelters through CCCM Cluster partners and Camp Management Committees.

Action Points

- CCCM Cluster Coordinators to inform CCCM cluster partners of the statements agreed to above.
- UNHCR to disseminate the proposed contents of maintenance and repair kits.

Elevated Walkways in Pauktaw & Myebon

- DRC and UNHCR reported that the elevated walkways in Pauktaw and Myebon are being destroyed for firewood, to improve shelters or to sabotage the IDP camp. Solidarites reported that the problems

were most acute for vacant shelters such as in Nget Chaung, Pauktaw. The problems began during construction and contractors replaced and repaired damaged walkways. However, as the damage worsens on a daily basis, it has become apparent that due to the scarcity of firewood and strict restrictions of movement imposed on IDPs, it is inevitable the elevated walkways will be destroyed during the dry season as they no longer have a necessary role to play in camp infrastructure.

- UNHCR pointed out that in the handover agreement, approved by the Rakhine State Government, all responsibility for the maintenance and repair of temporary shelter lies with the Rakhine State Government and not with Shelter Cluster partners.
- UNHCR suggested that as the dry season is fast approaching, as a point of principle, the damaged elevated walkways are not repaired immediately by Shelter Cluster partners. As the walkways are highly likely to be dismantled by IDPs anyway, IDPs should be free to make the choice of whether to access their elevated temporary shelter by ladder or from a walkway. As the walkways are not necessary until next rainy season, it was agreed that the specific issue of walkways will be addressed by Shelter Cluster partners later in the dry season when the full extent of the damage or destruction will be apparent.
- Solidarites and DRC objected to UNHCR's suggestion not to repair the elevated walkways and suggested that each location should be assessed on a case by case basis. In cases such as the vacant shelters in Pauktaw and rural Sittwe, shelters are being dismantled beyond the control of the future occupants. Solidarites argued that IDPs were entitled to receive the minimum temporary shelter standards.
- Shelter Cluster partners agreed that although the responsibility for the maintenance and repair of the damaged elevated walkways in Pauktaw and Myebon does not lie with the Shelter Cluster, but with the Rakhine State Government as outlined in the handover agreement, Shelter Cluster partners may provide assistance on a case by case basis.

Statements

- Responsibility for repairing and maintaining temporary shelters lies with the Rakhine State Government as outlined in the handover agreement.
- Shelter Cluster partners do not accept responsibility for repairing and maintaining elevated walkways in Pauktaw and Myebon. However, Shelter Cluster partners may respond on a case by case basis.

Scarcity of firewood

- The Executive Engineer (EE) of DRD expressed the need to deal with one of the root causes of the problem leading to the destruction of shelters and walkways: limited access to firewood. MRF pointed out that the topic has been a frequent agenda point in Shelter Cluster meetings for over a year without any progress being achieved on the issue. The EE stated that he did not believe it to be the responsibility of the Shelter Cluster, the CCCM Cluster or DRD alone to resolve. He suggested that advocacy was required at higher levels thorough the Point of Contact (PoC) or through the Ministry of Forestry (MoF) or the Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation (MoAI).
- CCCM Cluster reported that UNHCR is in the process of hiring a local consultant from the Ever Green Group (EGG) to conduct a feasibility survey into fuel efficient fuel options for IDP camps.

Action Point:

- OCHA to advocate with the Rakhine State Government to resolve the firewood issue.

5. CCCM Camp Infrastructure:

Overall needs / Construction by Partner

- UNHCR presented a consolidated list of camp infrastructure which had been validated by both the CCCM Cluster and the Department for Rural Development for approval by Shelter Cluster partners.
- Executive Engineer from DRD stated that the government list of camp infrastructure is awaiting approval. DRD will coordinate directly with UNHCR.
- DRD will construct camp infrastructure in Ah Nauk Ywe and Sin Thet Maw IDP camps in Pauktaw.
- UNHCR committed to filling all the gaps identified for camp infrastructure (camp management offices and multi-purpose buildings) in the IDP camps of Sittwe, Pauktaw and Myebon as identified by Shelter and CCCM partners.
- LWF requested that warehouses be included in the types of infrastructure provided by the Shelter Cluster.
- Shelter Cluster Coordinator explained that the option of warehouses was presented to CCCM partners. However as CCCM partners do not regard warehouses as being necessary at the present time, warehouses have not been included in package of camp infrastructure being constructed by UNHCR.
- The construction of warehouses, where required, will be the responsibility of the CCCM cluster and budgets for construction allocated from CCCM projects.
- Shelter Cluster partners agreed that the minimum standard for camp infrastructure in the IDP camps of Rakhine State should be, one camp management office, one small and one large, multi-purpose building for each group of 40-50 temporary 8-unit shelters.

Action Points:

- UNHCR to tender for the construction of camp infrastructure covering all the gaps in the IDP camps of Sittwe, Pauktaw and Myebon Townships.
- UNHCR to disseminate the design drawings and bill of quantity for a temporary warehouse to all Shelter Cluster and CCCM Cluster partners.

Government Modular Houses in Sittwe

- Executive Engineer from DRD reported that the Rakhine State Government intends to erect 4, two-story modular houses (donated by the Chinese Government) per IDP camp in Rural Sittwe. Decisions regarding their function have yet to be taken. However, the EE expect the structures to be used as multi-purpose buildings with functions varying from location to location.
- The DRD does not have any plans to use the modular houses for Health or Education purposes.
- The Executive Engineer will coordinate directly with UNHCR regarding plans for the Chinese modular housing to ensure the structures are added to the site plans which will be printed on vinyl noticeboards at the entrances of camps.

Action Point:

- Department of Rural Development (DRD) to coordinate closely with UNHCR regarding the distribution plan and use of the modular housing donated by the Chinese Government.

Any Other Business

- The Shelter Cluster Coordinator thanked participants for their active participation in a very productive coordination meeting.

- Due to time constraints, two agenda items, one for updates from the coordinated response in Rathedaung, the other regarding a presentation by a local building contractor concerning the quality of CGI sheeting will be carried onto the agenda of the next Shelter Cluster meeting (see following page for tentative agenda).

Participants List:

Name	Title	Organization	Email	Contact #
U Aung Than	District Officer	District DRD	uaungthan.stw@gmail.com	0949640125
Richard Tracey	Shelter Coordinator	UNHCR	tracey@unhcr.org	
Boyett Tiangco	Associate Site Planner	UNHCR	tiangco@unhcr.org	
Jolanda Dijk	CCCM Cluster Coord.	UNHCR	vandijkj@unhcr.org	
Andrea Piato	CCCM Cluster Coord.	UNHCR	piato@unhcr.org	09420237222
Zaw Min Htet	Shelter Associate	UNHCR	htet@unhcr.org	09421713459
Aung Ze Ya	Shelter Associate	UNHCR	ya@unhcr.org	
U Htay Aung	Field Manager	MRCS	htayaungr1973@gmail.com	
Nyi Nyi Zaw	Shelter Officer	MRCS	nyinyizaw975@gmail.com	0949761736
Maung Maung Min Htaik	DM Officer	MRCS	mmminhhtaik@gmail.com	09401669771
U Kyaw Htun Wai	Admin/Log Officer	CARE	arakanhtun@gmail.com	09421766301
Ko Ko Hlaing	FOC	CARE	kokohlaing123@gmail.com	09421051184
Aung Aung	Shelter Supervisor	CARE		0931091854
Fred Otieno	CCCM Coordinator	LWF	fndaga@gmail.com	09401586270
Stephane SENIA	Emergency PM	SI	NRS.eme.pm@solidarites-myanmar.org	09401539033
Ko Ko Lwin	Program Manager	MRF	kokolwin@gmail.com	09420127725
Laurent de Valensart	HAO	OCHA	hao2fosittwe@gmail.com	
Thant Zin Oo	Field Officer	MAUK	thantzinoo804@gmail.com	09420244467
Sarla Varma	WASH Specialist	UNICEF	svarma@unicef.org	
Kyaw Win Maw	WASH Consultant	UNICEF	kyawwinmaw@gmail.com	095096427